Fatmah Bahalwan was sitting at her desk. The whole day she was busy as a speaker on a variety of cooking talk shows held on radios. She then turned on her desktop computer to greet members of the mailing list Natural Cooking Club (NCC) that she had founded on January 2005. She answered some questions addressed to her.

She re-read the post from one of the NCC moderators, Wisnu Martono, who is also her own husband, on membership and mailing list traffic. It was dated December 4, 2008:

"Dear all, shortly NCC members will reach the “fantastic” number of 6000 people. I think we’ve never dreamed of this number when we first started this mailing list. Increasing number of members means greater traffic. Until last month, the average mail traffic on the NCC is 75 posts/day. In certain months it even reached 100 posts/day."

Fatmah pondered this for a moment. She was proud of her achievement, but she felt that there were to do for the NCC community. She still had a lot of dreams. Opening a cooking school, for example, or a Cooperative. The cooperation she established at the beginning of the year 2007 with Kompas Cyber Media, a sub-channel of www.kompas.com, is the prove given by the public of the importance of the mailing list.

The growing community must not lose its sense of community. This is Fatmah next challenge. She has to look for types of activities and potential partners with the same vision and mission to develop the values of NCC together.

Internet and Its Role in the Formation of Community

The revolutionary development of Information and Communication Technology (ICT) allows each person to be connected with each other through the Internet. The equal distribution of information and access to information among the people has helped to improve the quality of lives.

In Indonesia, there were 25 million Internet users in 2007. It was an increase of 25% compared to the previous year. The main reason for that is easier and cheaper infrastructure, which results in a more affordable price for internet connection offered by telecommunication providers in Indonesia. This is a distinct advantage because the more easily accessible Internet, the more knowledge and insight into the community because the search for information becomes easier.

\[http://www.apjii.or.id/dokumentasi/statistik.php?lang=ind\]
The development of Internet technology and information technology has transformed the media landscape. Communication is at first only one-way traffic, namely from companies to consumers. And then it moves into a two-way communications, including between consumer and enterprise, and between consumers themselves. No wonder, if many new communities are formed rapidly through the medium of Internet and later became a respected group in society.

A clear mark of the rapid development of Internet users in Indonesia, in the year 2000, is the lively discussion through mailing lists. Mailing list in the Indonesian language is called “Milis”; it is a discussion forum for the group of people who have similar interests or those from the same community groups.

Every ordinary Internet users can easily set up a discussion group, using facilities provided by yahoogroups.com. The Effectiveness of the discussions is further enhanced by the moderation/management and good archiving facilities. Not surprisingly, at the end of 2001, a study recorded that there were at least 49,000 community mailing lists at yahoo groups Indonesia.

Only a few online communities that eventually grew its membership into more than one hundred people. Of the many communities being evaluated, in 2001, only 1170 (4.5%) managed to have members of more than a hundred people. Some of them have members of more than 8000 people. One of the communities that focus on cooking hobby is Natural Cooking Club (NCC) that as founded by Fatmah Bahalwan with her husband Vishnu Ali Martono. Even if on its development the mailing list also incorporated business elements into it, it is still mainly on culinary-related business.

Descriptions of the NCC mailing list can be read in www.ncc-indonesia.com as follows:

"Natural Cooking Club (NCC) is a forum for all lovers of good food." The paragraph goes on to explain how the NCC fellow citizens socialized with each other: "We speak mainly in Indonesian language, yet we gladly welcome anyone to share and post in English. It's always hard to describe NCC in one simple paragraph (not even one full hour of the radio show). So dash off to our website NCC-indonesia.com to find out more about who we are, and what on earth we do in this gigantic community."

**Revisiting the history of the establishment Natural Cooking Club (NCC).**

The impact of monetary crisis in Indonesia in 1998 was far-reaching. This tough situation for the regular salary-office-worker inspired many people to start their own business. It was no exception for Fatmah Bahalwan. At that time, she worked as an executive secretary in a well-known private bank. Like many other people, she began to think about her future, wanted new challenges, and more pay, thus Fatmah felt it was time for her to start her own business, out of the routine job as an office clerk.

Since she was a child, Fatmah has displayed a considerable cooking talent. Born in a big family, the task of cooking for the whole family, had fell to her. She also helps relatives who were having a party to cook. She is the representative of her family.

With these skills she began to try penetrating the catering business in the office areas. Her long work experience has given her a strong network among executive-level secretary. Secretaries are usually the decision makers for the choice of catering, for office events or simply for the choice of cookies at an office meeting. Thus, Fatmah easily broke through, from contact with friends whom she had been familiar with for a long time. Thus, what was first started as cake-selling business has evolved into a catering business called "Natural Catering" on a medium scale.
Not only that. Because Fatmah have known the Internet for a long time, she use it as promotion tools using emails that she distributed through her network. To her surprise, she received orders for her cakes double than what she had received before. Her understanding on the positive aspects of Internet on business and community began to emerge. The following is her explanation describing the situation at the time she decided to move the quadrant, from those of salary-man, to the new quadrants, the quadrant entrepreneur - entrepreneurial.

"At first it was just for fun, but somehow they were sold out and began to develop. Then, I seek my identity, and I conclude that food business will never die. The prove is, I started selling cakes baked in my own kitchen using only four pans, and now it uses hundreds of pan. In fact, in the end, I develop a catering business for special events. These conditions convince me to quit my job in 2004."

Fatmah also noticed that many of her friends with expertise to make a cake or cooking, but they are often reluctant to share their knowledge. She thought that it's an inappropriate and irrelevant habit in the current information age. Instead she feels that by sharing knowledge, the more people who know her as an expert in this field and it would bring no small business potential. Knowledge that she had gained from many courses, as well as from recipe books she had bought, were distributed through various discussions on various mailing lists she had joined.

By looking at the improvement of her catering business, and her pleasure to communicate over the Internet, she saw an opportunity to form a distinct community. With the help of her husband Wisnu Ali Martono, Fatmah Bahalwan established the NCC (Natural Cooking Club) mailing list on January 15, 2005.

The basic idea of NCC mailing list is to strengthen networking among fellow members who have similar hobbies and talents that is cooking. Another is that it is a forum for anyone who wants to enter and explore the culinary industry. Started from this virtual interaction, they held meetings to try new recipes, to learn cake-decorating techniques, and to do other culinary-related things.

At first, there were only 4 members. The next few months, membership started to increase, along with some 'unusual' off-line activities among the members, including the Tour d'Stores. Membership started to grow rapidly since the mailing list profile was published in Kompas on the third week of November 2005. Within three months after that, at the time of the mailing list first anniversary, membership of NCC had exceeded 1000 people, or a 3-fold increase. Membership growth experienced significant increase in line with the increase variety of off-line events.

Now (at the end of March 2009), NCC mailing list has over 6000 members, mostly living in Indonesia, especially Jakarta. But some are from all over the world, and they spread the culinary virus to the whole world. Membership will increase manifold if there's no administrative requirements to become a member of the NCC, which is filling out the form of Request for Info and they have to send SMS to confirm their membership. This requirement is needed to screened members who are really serious to join in the discussion on culinary and not just a passive member.

There are eight people who look after the smooth administrative flow and exchange of information in the mailing list every day, including husband and wife: Fatmah and Wisnu Ali Martono; Dewi Anwar, Eka Arei Shanti, Moekti Ichtiarini (deceased), Nadrah Shahab, Riana Suryasusanti Ambarsari and Jenny.

**A Place to Share Knowledge**

For stay-at-home mothers, it is increasingly easier to select Internet connection provided by telecommunication service providers with a cheaper price and more affordable. On the other
hand, career-woman mothers can take advantage of their spare time to browse, to see mailing list, check emails, or chat, using the office Internet connection. Wherever they are, the Internet has become part of their daily activities.

Cooking in Indonesia is still a woman's duty. Although a woman is a career woman and spends a lot more time outside the home, cooking management for the whole family was concentrated entirely on her. For those who enjoyed cooking, the duty to provide food for the family is, on its own, an entertainment. They hunt for recipes, not only from women's magazines, but also from searching and browsing the Internet. She made clippings of the recipe pages from magazines, while compiling the results of her Internet search in a separate file.

One weakness of the recipes obtained by cooking enthusiasts is the lack of coaching process. Even in the Internet, with no restrictions in its presentation pages, they deal mostly with 'how to cook' technique, which is more of a one-way communication. Consultation process using frequently asked questions about the difficulties in the process of making a particular food are still rarely available.

This gap caught Fatmah's attention. She realized that cooking is a combination between knowledge and skills. Cooking fans, especially beginners, are hungry for guidance from expert coaches on the field. Therefore, one of the strengths of the NCC mailing list led by Fatmah, is the sharing experiences and solutions, along with the nitty-gritty difficulties of cooking.

In the mailing list daily discussions, sharing recipes are not the only activity. Tips on cooking, which discussed mostly in women's magazines only in general because of page limitations, are described in detail. This is possible because, in addition to Fatmah herself, there are many other members who are also experts in the field of a particular cuisine.

Therefore the consultation and discussion process on any topic happen not only from the member to the founding members only, but has become a member-to-member (Peer-to-Peer) discussion. The correct or incorrect technique in a particular issue is perhaps the results of the thinking of so many people. This is in line with the wisdom of crowd² that goes 'Why the Many are Smarter than the Few and How Collective Wisdom Shapes Business, Economies, Societies and nations '.

With the passage of time, ownership of the NCC mailing list is no longer monopolized by one or two founders, but is shared by almost all active members. For Fatmah herself, the mailing list has become very potential to support her catering business.

**NCC Mailing List Regulation**

Because it is a mailing list of food lovers, it is not surprising that the discussion topic is mostly on practical advice on cooking, articles about food stuffs, special cake-making tools, etc. Members are also allowed to have 'out of topics' (OOT) discussion, as long as it's not too far removed from the activities of the member, or those with emergency and life threatening nature.

This mailing list also has a compete set of rules called netket (exhibit 1) that must be obeyed by all members. For example, members are asked to leave no more than 2 previous posts in replying a topic, and they are not allow to put image bigger than 70 kb. The interesting thing is, different from other mailing lists, which strictly prohibits members to do sales, or to send promotion emails.

Not so with NCC. In the spirit of promoting a business-related culinary and cooking, Fatmah Bahalwan with the consent of its members made an agreement that promotion can be done

---

only on Thursday and they must remain associated with the culinary. The whole set of netiquette is a far-sighted insight in dealing with members whose numbers will keep on increasing, in addition to teach the members that even in the virtual world there are some set of rules that must be mutually agreed upon.

In fact, there are always new members who did not understand these promotion restriction rules, so times and again, there are promotion emails that got out not on Thursday. The funny thing is, senior members are not angry with this. They impose a unique reprimand system to naughty members by ‘throwing them a ladle’.

The penalty for a breach on netiquette will be given in stages, from gentle reprimand, strict warning, members blocking, until expulsion. A moderator, based on reports from members, does ladle throwing. Ladle (“centong”) is a unique and popular utensil in Indonesian kitchen. "Beware of flying ladle!" is the 'intimate greeting' and warnings from the NCC moderator, most of the times it is intended for new members.

Examples of this throwing and pounding business with the ladle can be read in this one post: Posted by: snow_white3005:

"Is there any moderator that has pounded you with the ladle yet? If there is, enjoy the bruises, next time please erase the tail posting first.... "

Internal and external NCC publications

Fatmah Bahalwan has never made special advertisement for this mailing list. Basically, what makes this community great is its public relations activities, and Word-of-mouth Communication from the writings of diligent members in their own blogs.

Public Relations.

Proximity to the media used well by the NCC moderators. Because of the unique and interesting activities that they have, they were able to invite journalists to cover and then publish their events. With all these activities, NCC has gained a lot of exposure from radio stations, private TV and print media (newspapers and magazines).

- Reviews on Sunday edition of Kompas daily, Community rubric
  Since the story about the NCC mailing list and its founder, Fatma Bahalwan, appeared in Sunday edition of Kompas, (November 2005), the members of the mailing list is increasing. This certainly is understandable because of the credibility of the media (BBC), and many prospective members did looking for a place to share knowledge and learn culinary arts and food as declared by the NCC mailing list.

Message History NCC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jan</th>
<th>Feb</th>
<th>Mar</th>
<th>Apr</th>
<th>May</th>
<th>Jun</th>
<th>Jul</th>
<th>Aug</th>
<th>Sep</th>
<th>Oct</th>
<th>Nov</th>
<th>Dec</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>2816</td>
<td>3452</td>
<td>3604</td>
<td>2008</td>
<td>2016</td>
<td>1683</td>
<td>1682</td>
<td>2099</td>
<td>2287</td>
<td>2407</td>
<td>2407</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>2496</td>
<td>2451</td>
<td>3029</td>
<td>2854</td>
<td>2547</td>
<td>2306</td>
<td>2279</td>
<td>2208</td>
<td>2164</td>
<td>1474</td>
<td>1710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>3787</td>
<td>3708</td>
<td>4201</td>
<td>2827</td>
<td>3854</td>
<td>2834</td>
<td>3091</td>
<td>3408</td>
<td>3055</td>
<td>1659</td>
<td>1888</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>2099</td>
<td>2287</td>
<td>2467</td>
<td>2520</td>
<td>1944</td>
<td>2053</td>
<td>2113</td>
<td>2506</td>
<td>2234</td>
<td>1816</td>
<td>2393</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: naturalcookingclub@yahoogroups.com

- NCC Break MURI Records
  News that will gain more attention from target customers is those from a third party. The NCC founders appear to understand of these principles. NCC has twice held the MURID record-breaking event.
The first record-breaking event was performed on NCC first anniversary, February 2006, in cooperation with PT Sharp Electronics Indonesia. It was a record on Cake Decorating with the Most Number of Participants, i.e. 100 people, in one place at one time. The second record-breaking event is in Pasaraya on occasion of the 481st anniversary of the city of Jakarta, June 2008.

Attended by more than 100 members (including members from abroad: India and Qatar) they held a cupcake-decorating contest, to create 2008 fruit cupcakes, the year the MURI record-breaking event was held. The decoration theme varied greatly and very unique: flowers, Bajaj (three wheels vehicle), football, Jakarta anniversary, and green environment.

In addition to making the two MURI record-breaking events, NCC also conduct routine annual meeting event known as HMFF (Home-Made Food Fiesta). At HMFF, NCC members were given the opportunity to show off their culinary creations, to receive appreciation from fellow members. This kind of event has not been done by other mailing lists that are "the contemporary" of NCC.

With all these activities, NCC managed to gain a lot of exposure from radio stations, private TV and printed media (newspapers and magazines), domestic and abroad. For magazines, newspapers, tabloids, and TV (SCTV, RCTI, Anteve, Global TV, TransTV, Metro TV, O’channel) there are Kompas, Nova, Sedap Sekejap, and Daai TV. For overseas coverage, the medium is television, programs like Channel News Asia, Reuters TV, Star Asia, and CNN.

**Blogger**

Of so many active members, moderators and regular members, in addition to holding discussions on the mailing lists, they also write their activities with NCC in their own blogs. This increases the reach of the NCC since some of the new members interested in the NCC after reading the reviews written in blogs and other social networking media such as Friendster.

Fatmah in one interview stated: "Although the NCC has many moderators, without genuine support from its members, it's hard to develop this mailing list. Without such an enthusiastic support from the members, NCC mailing list is nothing."

**Website**

In addition to mailing list for exchanging information at naturalcookingclub@yahoogroups.com, NCC also has a website on NCC-indonesia.com (Exhibit 2). This site serves as the front door to attract new members, attach courses schedules, displaying the latest news, such as MURI record-breaking event and annual archipelago food exhibition event, and the some teasers, such as easy to serve of food recipes.

Official website address of NCC is www.ncc-indonesia.com. This site is also the channel site of www.kompas.com, an online media that is just newly renovated and relaunch by its owner, the Kompas Gramedia group - Exhibit 3. NCC has also been working (in 2006) with other media, namely TV Indosiar, to run their sites IndoCooking Club (ICC). Since the year 2008 NCC has established a cooperation with www.vivanews.com, a website owned by TVOne, to provide regular culinary videos and which can be accessed freely on the site.

---

3www.ncc-indonesia.com
Radio

Radio is one of the mass media that have interacted with the NCC. NCC was conventional guest for conventional broadcast session, and also the guest for live broadcast cooking session. Radios who had invited NCC to come as guest in their broadcast session are Cosmo, Delta FM, Radio for Women, Trijaya FM, RRI Pro-2, Radio Utan Kayu, I-radio. In addition, from 2008 NCC became the regular host of Family Kitchen at Radio Bahana, every Wednesday at 09-10.00.

Indonesian Consumity Expo

Community-based consumption is a new trend that cannot be denied. Initial studies conducted by the survey institute, In-depth, show this trend. NCC is one of the invited mailing lists to the event of ICE2007 (Indonesian Consumnity Expo) held by the Prasetya Mulya Business School, along with several other large mailing lists in Indonesia. In NCC ICE2008, they were also invited, as the representation of thriving culinary mailing lists. One impact of the presence of NCC at ICE is that NCC is invited in a number of marketing events.

Culinary Contributor

In addition of being the subject of media coverage, NCC is also the culinary section contributor for some media, among them are the free culinary magazine Icip-icip (published 2007-2008), InfoKuliner tabloid and Kompas.com.

Partner

Besides giving personal lessons, NCC has for several times become partner to some institutions (Bank Danamon, Bank Indonesia, café Coffee House) in providing culinary training. Some malls have also asked NCC to do culinary demonstrations.

NCC Activities

Daily Discussion and Special Event

Basic activities for NCC mailing list are divided into online and offline activities. Online activities are basically internet-based, such as daily discussion. There are also special events, to appreciate certain type of foods, such as Donut Week, Pudding Week, and Traditional Food Week. At special events all NCC member have the chance to share their food creations specific for that event with other members (using photograph or recipes), then the creation will be judged based by certain criterias (creativity, appearance), and then it will be given appreciation.

Although it is still within the scope of NCC, special events have their own host, with its own blog maintained specifically for special events. The function of special event is to accommodate creativity of its member for certain kinds of food.

Concerning the daily discussion, the posting traffic number of NCC is quite large. The following data shows the monthly posting traffic. December 2005 is the busiest month of posting traffic, which was shortly after NCC profile, was put into Kompas Sunday edition. One problem faced by is the large number of useless posting (junk mail). Moderators since the beginning have anticipated this by applying strict netiquette (mailing list regulation) so that most posting will be useful for most members.

Offline Events
In addition to activities in cyberspace, many other activities are carried out in real-world (offline), activities that require face-to-face interaction. The first is to learn cooking more seriously. Second is a simple act of courtesy, to further the relationship build online and maintain it. And, that also enriches the knowledge and socialization from cyberspace.

Homemade Food Fiesta, held annually, MURI record-breaking (cake decorating contest and cupcakes), Tour d’Stores, Tour d’Market, demos for members, cooking & baking party, “bakul an” cake, tossing order, Food Photography (FP) course, Catering Management course, etc.. Courses the idea of FP was later followed by similar mailing list. Besides that, NCC also held an online writing course (in collaboration with Kompas) and the blogging course.

The most routine activities are cake baking and cooking classes, and Food Photography courses. In addition, there are interesting activities, such as offline gathering, called Homemade Food Fiesta (HMFF), Cooking and Baking Party, Catering Management Course and stores or market tour (Tour d'toko, Tour d'pasar). HMFF and TDT (Tour d'toko) is the off-line activities “found” by NCC mailing list.

**Offline Activities: Home Made Food Fiesta (HMFF)**

HMFF is the activity where members can show their created dish to other members. For beginners or those who have just learned to cook, this event became an important event to show their progress.

All members shall be free to taste the food made by other members. This event will help to increase knowledge about cooking, especially dishes from other places in the archipelago, with a variety of unique taste. For documentation, the moderators will then compile the whole food recipes, which then can be accessed through the NCC mailing list; it is from members and for members.

One example of this event is a competition activity entitled "Gank Fight", held in December 2008 (Exhibit 7).

**Tour d'toko or Tour d'pasar**

This is a quite unique event of the NCC mailing list, and one of the events eagerly waited by the members. Tour d'toko is a walk or tour to increase knowledge about cooking, by going to cookies materials and baking tools stores. For example, on an event, the members stopped at several stores: Store Ani Jl. Gn Sahari, Mira stores, jl.Hasyim Ashari, Rossy jl. Kaji, Tiggerson edible photo company, Restomart-Gajah Mada Plaza. In addition to shopping at these stores (and get a souvenir or Goody Bag), NCC members also get enlightenment from cake experts or chef who had been asked to stand by in some specific stores. The event also drew the attention of the media, some journalists had participated in the tour, such as Femina, Ummi, tabloids Nova, Delicious, The Jakarta Post, Warta Kota, Ummi, etc..

A similar event was also held by NCC members living in Japan who wrote about their experience in "Tour de Ichiba Market".

**Making a recipe book**

NCC also has published cookbooks in cooperation with Dian Rakyat publishers. The first book (exhibit 8) was titled “18 Favorite Cake and Cookies, Step by Step and Potent Strategies”. NCC latest recipe book was published in November 2008, the “45 Amazing Cup Cakes”, and it are now available in leading bookstores.
NCC Member Type

Since the beginning, there were no restrictions on membership of the NCC. Experts or no experts, everyone can join. This can be seen in the explanation section of "NCC Profiles" in there website, as follows: "In its simplicity, NCC is a collection of home " cookie basket " (their term for home-based cake business) network - which has earn income from their own home kitchens. Some even started the business from scratch by joining the NCC mailing list. 

Most of NCC members are women. But there are also male members, although only in a small amount. The profession of the men is food stylist and food consultant in food and culinary magazines. For female members, many initially did not know how to cook, but after joining this mailing list, they are now not just good at cooking, some can even sell their own made cakes. "I'm happy now and am often moved from reading the posts of members who have become successful," recalled Fatmah. But there are female members who already have cooking skills, and they aim to share information on this mailing list.

In terms of profession, the members consisted of women who work in private or government offices, full time housewives, work-at-home housewives working in the culinary field, professionals, the owner of catering, recipe maker, about food and cake recipes writers.

There are some distinct characteristics of the active members in the community. Members who joined at the beginning still remember the tough times in the early establishment of the community. The newer members are probably still trying to tune-in with the community. This identification is required in determining the absorption impression rate of the community towards the individual, and each segment's contribution to the community.

Based from an explorative study4, mainly conducted through participatory observation, online interviews, and observations of the files and messages, the characters of NCC members can be categorized as follows: (1) The 'One day I will cook that', (2) The Pro Wannabe, (3) The Real Professional, (4) The Consultant.

'One day I will cook that'

Some members of the mailing list are women who work at the office. Cooking is actually their hobby, but due to time constraints they can only become observers, the recipes collector. Although they collect recipes diligently, but in general they could not practice it alone at home. Or if they could, it will be only once in a while. Alternatively, they will give the recipes to their housemaid, to be used for family cooking.

For members who are of this type, offline meetings for cooking courses may not be so important. They derive their satisfaction by tuning in with other members and exchanging latest stories related to food. If NCC publishes a recipe book, they will be the first people who buy it, as their collection.

The Pro Wannabe

In general, members of NCC already have basic cooking skills. However, their confidence will grow after they join cooking classes held by NCC. Because the abundant information about cooking recipes, many members who were only cooking for themselves before, decide to try to market their own food products, and eventually became a home-based entrepreneur whose trade is specifically to provide food for celebration events. As also explained by

---

Fatmah Bahalwan⁵ to kompas.com, on May 28, 2008 that: ‘Most of NCC members are mothers. Many were initially not familiar with the kitchen, but are now good at cooking and even selling cookies. I’m happy now and am often moved by reading the posts of the member who have become successful.’

**The Real Professional**

In addition, many culinary-related home industry entrepreneurs join the community to increase interaction and expand their market. Because by their affiliation with this community, then automatically, they have joined a group of people who are clearly included in their target markets. In terms of frequency of posting, they have the highest rate, probably because their promotional and economic motives.

The people who fall within this category typically provide catering services, cake orders, cafes, and other dishes, in large number for special occasions such as celebration. There are already hundreds of members of this profession. For example, one of the members, Anis, who settled in Solo, owns a café and cake selling. Anis pursues this profession after she attended the courses conducted by the NCC. Even her culinary business was once covered by a television program special on culinary home industry business review.

**The Consultant**

Classified in this group is the moderator of a mailing list, and other members who are all have one thing in common, that is good at cooking. Some already published recipes handbook, or they have culinary-related profession as editor at a women’s magazine, food stylist, etc. In the daily activities of the mailing list, they play a very big role as a consultant or as a place to ask. This group is called the ‘Master’, which means teacher, and other members in the group give the provision of this title.

In addition, there are also those who have become teachers in NCC courses. Usually they are housewives and at the same time they have their own home-industry business. Other members eagerly await them because they actively encouraged members to keep studying and working in the culinary field. Emails posting from this type of members have a huge influence to other members.

Interestingly, one of the members is a man, Budi Sutomo, with a nickname Budi Boga. He started his involvement in culinary world when he was a teenager. He continued his study at vocational schools and earned his bachelor degree in the field of culinary studies. Until now, he has been engaged in a variety of careers in the culinary and nutritional field, culinary training in Thailand and luxury hotels in Jakarta. He has written over 22 books on food and nutrition. In addition, he also professes as a food stylist for food products advertising. He was also the editor of a catering magazine Sartika Kartini and other types of magazines. Until now, he is still actively writing to be published in books, magazines, and online media such as asialblogging network and sendokgarpu.com.

**NCC Competitors: Dapur Bunda**

There is other cooking-related mailing list, but one of which can be regarded as NCC closest competitors is the mailing list, Dapur Bunda (Exhibit 6). It was founded by a woman who is also dedicated in cooking, known as the Mother Inong, who is also active in culinary mailing list Jalansutra.

Dapur Bunda is an online cooking community that has characteristics similar to the NCC, the high number of members (3818), and its focus in discussing cooking-related activities. Founded in 2001, DB or Dapur Bunda also has its own website at kitchen-bunda.com.

---

⁵www.kompas.com/28 Mei 2008
Dapur Bunda has received exposure in the tabloids Nova. But the death of the owner and founder, Mother Inong, in the year 2006 has dampened the community spirit. As a fellow mailing list, this sad news was also a headline topic in NCC community.

Message History Dapur Bunda

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jan</th>
<th>Feb</th>
<th>Mar</th>
<th>Apr</th>
<th>May</th>
<th>Jun</th>
<th>Jul</th>
<th>Aug</th>
<th>Sep</th>
<th>Oct</th>
<th>Nov</th>
<th>Dec</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>325</td>
<td>230</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>213</td>
<td>322</td>
<td>221</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>251</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>228</td>
<td>323</td>
<td>199</td>
<td>355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>818</td>
<td>616</td>
<td>723</td>
<td>581</td>
<td>355</td>
<td>345</td>
<td>217</td>
<td>282</td>
<td>303</td>
<td>216</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>1035</td>
<td>604</td>
<td>729</td>
<td>895</td>
<td>843</td>
<td>824</td>
<td>713</td>
<td>833</td>
<td>1182</td>
<td>596</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>734</td>
<td>688</td>
<td>634</td>
<td>439</td>
<td>936</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>894</td>
<td>967</td>
<td>887</td>
<td>596</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>945</td>
<td>712</td>
<td>927</td>
<td>537</td>
<td>756</td>
<td>807</td>
<td>789</td>
<td>601</td>
<td>759</td>
<td>703</td>
<td>468</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>993</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>635</td>
<td>361</td>
<td>461</td>
<td>535</td>
<td>267</td>
<td>196</td>
<td>256</td>
<td>542</td>
<td>710</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>297</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>427</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. Dapur Bunda vs NCC (from their mailing lists)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Dapurbunda.com</th>
<th>Ncc-Indonesia.com</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recipes</td>
<td>V</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mailing list</td>
<td>V</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooking Class</td>
<td>V</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Offline gathering</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Books</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Articles</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Around Kitchen Info</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gallery or photos</td>
<td>V</td>
<td>V</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sense of Community**

The success or fall of a community can be measured using a variable called 'Sense of Community'. The higher the sense of community is, the more solid the community. There are many indicators to measure the sense of community. Some of them are recorded in a particular qualitative study of the Online Sense of community\(^6\), those are (1) shared symbols, (2) the presence of a place where members can pour their heart out, (3) the existence of a spiritual bond between members, and (4) losing track of time, (5) friendly environment.

**Shared symbols**

The conversations on this mailing list also have terms that are only understandable to some people. This is as illustrated by the term 'common symbol', first coined by McMillan and Chavis the originator of the theory of sense of community\(^7\). Even the moderator’s name was abbreviated into FB, which stands for Fatmeh Bahalwan. And there are also typical cooking abbreviations such as ‘Otang’ which means ‘Oven Tangkringan’\(^8\), or DCC which means “Dark Cooking Chocolate”.

**The outpouring of the heart**


\(^7\)http://www.wright-house.com/psychology/sense-of-community.html
And since most members of this mailing list are mothers, it is not unusual that there are emails containing long personal and private stories, using common face-to-face conversation language. An example of this kind of posting is from a woman named Sandra Lena, a Pro Wannabe (Exhibit 10).

**Spiritual Association**

McMillan and Chavis\(^8\) on their colossal study admit the difficulty in describing this item. But one thing for sure is spiritual bond seems to appear in various levels within each community. They give as example the concept of 'soul', which is the emotional and intellectual energy behind the establishment of a national day for the black community in the United States. Although the spirit is difficult to describe, but one member, who is also a culinary entrepreneur, seems to get some sort of understanding about it, as written below: "If you all have the time, please watch today's Culinary Tour program. There is the Priyayi Coffee & Cakes, our current business. There is the spirit of NCC spirit there. All would have been impossible without the NCC. Thank you all, especially to Mbak Fat and the teachers of Cheesecake courses in March 2008. Mbak Riana and Uni Dewi Anwar."  

The spiritual bond was very much felt when one of the moderators passed away due to cancer. The writing of one member in their own blog can best describe the emotional closeness of friendship between members. (See Exhibit).

**Addicted**

Often, an online community makes people feel addicted, like they are trapped in it, so much so that they do not realize how much time has been spent for the community, thus forgetting the time.

For those who have a strong self-control over time, they will usually be aware of this, as told by Ms. Hasto in an online interview: "Just because joining NCC and Dapur Bunda have made my email inbox full, let alone if I join other mailing list... It will be disastrous... when will I cook if all I ever do is looking at mailing list."  

But this awareness is often lost each time a member feel they require the 'other' members as their place of refuge. If this happens, then the addiction can spread out and infect other members.

**Friendly environment**

It has become a tradition in the NCC community, if there are new members joining in, and then they will introduce themselves. The response and welcome from other members give off the impression that NCC is a friendly community. "Hi Lynn ... nice to meet you :) Congratulations for joining the NCC ... We hope that you'll soon be contaminated with the spirit of baking, right..."  

If one has questions about cuisine, even basic questions, there will be a lot of responds from members. This user-friendly environment makes members feel comfortable and not afraid or embarrassed to ask.

---

\(^8\)Mc Millan and Chavis (1986) Sense of Community.
What's Next?

Fatmah realize the high number of members can become a strong point, but also a weakness if it’s not managed wisely. To manage a mailing list with members reaching nearly 6000 people, a solid moderators’ team unity is very important.

Her vast culinary knowledge, her desire to share those knowledge, encourage by many enthusiastic members who always flocked the culinary course held every month, make her think and dream to establish a cooking school, by improving the basic curriculum of cake-making courses, and later on there should even be classes in advance cake decorations.

Many ideas are coming from members of the mailing list or in a serious meeting with fellow moderators. In addition, in their husband-and-wife daily routine, Fatmah Bahalwan and Wisnu Ali Martono are always looking for ideas to develop the mailing list in terms of membership and in term of its benefits and convenience obtained by members, which are increasing in numbers. The change in membership quantity will demand changes in the mailing list management pattern.

Everyone has their own interests, and together they must build this community. Ideas for future activities and the possibility of cooperation or partnership have been neatly arranged into a table form by one of the moderators. "First thing first" ... she muttered. But which is the ‘first thing’, that is one question still raging on her mind.
### Exhibit 1. Unique abbreviation in NCC: all about cooking aspects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ams : American Risoles</td>
<td>GFCF: Gluten Free Casein Free</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCC : Birthday Cake</td>
<td>HHMHD: Halal Halal nam Haboch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BCC : Blueberry Cheese Cake</td>
<td>NCC: Natural Cooking Club</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BF: Black Forest</td>
<td>NYCC: New York Cheese Cake</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BoJ: Balls of Joy, alias Rhum Balls</td>
<td>Otang: Oven Tangking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BF: Baking Powder</td>
<td>Pau: Pavlova</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPDA: Baking Powder Double Acting</td>
<td>PS: Putri Salju</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bolgul : Bolu Gulung</td>
<td>R1: Royal Icing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BoKus : Bolu Kukus</td>
<td>SCC: Spreadable Cheddar Cheese</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brotus : Brownies Kukus</td>
<td>SHM: Susuental Manis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brogang : Brownies Panggang</td>
<td>SPK: Supermarket</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC: Cream Cheese</td>
<td>SPC: Triple Cheese Cake</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCC: Classic Cheese Cake</td>
<td>TBS: Toko Bahan Kue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CoCC: Chocolate Chips Cookies</td>
<td>TDF: Tour d’Toko yang sangat bersejarah itu ;)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTI: Cream of Tar Tar</td>
<td>TdP: Tour de Pasar Ikan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTS: Chocolate Transfer Sheet</td>
<td>TdPM: Tour de Pasar Mayestik</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCC: Dark Cooking Chocolate</td>
<td>Telur antero: telur utuh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCB: Death By Chocolate</td>
<td>WCC: White Cooking Chocolate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EoD : End of Discussion</td>
<td>WhC: Whipping Cream</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eot: End of Topic</td>
<td>WBC: Anggotol Baru Gabung</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Exhibit 2. Founder, NCC, Fatmah Bahalwan and Husband, Wisnu Martoyo

![Founder, NCC, Fatmah Bahalwan and Husband, Wisnu Martoyo](image)

### Exhibit 3. Website [www.ncc-indonesia.com](http://www.ncc-indonesia.com)
Exhibit 4. website NCC in www.kompas.com

Exhibit 5. The Site of Competitor, Dapur Bunda, www.dapurbunda.com

Exhibit 7. Recipes book by NCC

First Book (Left): 18 Cake & Cookies Step by Step + Jurus-Jurus Jitu
Second book (Right): 45 Amazing Cup Cakes Step by Step + Jurus-Jurus Jitu